



MINUTES

HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

THE CORPORATION OF THE CITY OF MISSISSAUGA

TUESDAY, JULY 27, 2010 - 9:00 A.M.

COUNCIL CHAMBERS

SECOND FLOOR, CIVIC CENTRE

300 CITY CENTRE DRIVE, MISSISSAUGA, ONTARIO L5B 3C1

www.mississauga.ca

Members Present

Councillor Carolyn Parrish, Ward 6
Councillor George Carlson, Ward 11 (**CHAIR**)
Mohammad Haque (Citizen Member)
James Holmes (Citizen Member)
Bernie Hu (Citizen Member)
Craig Lawrence (Citizen Member)
Rick Mateljan (Citizen Member)
Gay Peppin (Citizen Member)
Michael Spaziani (Citizen Member)
James Tovey (Citizen Member) (**VICE-CHAIR**)
Matthew Wilkinson (Citizen Member)

Staff Present

Elaine Eigl, Heritage Coordinator, Community Services
Anna Liza La Rosa, Legislative Coordinator, Clerk's Office

Contact: Anna Liza La Rosa, Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk 905-615-3200 ext. 5425 Fax 905-615-4181
annaliza.larosa@mississauga.ca

CALL TO ORDER- 9:01 a.m.

DECLARATIONS OF DIRECT (OR INDIRECT) PECUNIARY INTEREST: Nil

Later in the meeting, Michael Spaziani declared a conflict of interest regarding Item 6 on the agenda.

Councillor Carlson recommended that Item 6 on the Agenda be dealt with after the Sandford Farm Park presentation. Michael Spaziani moved approval of the amended agenda. The motion was voted upon and carried.

PRESENTATION

This presentation was heard in conjunction with Item 3 on the agenda.

- A. Stephanie Snow, Harrington McAvan Ltd., Landscape Architects presented the concept for Sandford Farm Park, 845 White Clover Way.

Ms. Snow stated that Sandford Farm Park will showcase the heritage resources of the park, including the heritage Walnut Grove and the footprint of the heritage home on the site that has since been destroyed by fire. Ms. Snow indicated that the design concept for the park incorporates interpretive signage to add an educational component to the heritage commemoration.

Councillor Parrish stated that she is delighted that the remnants of the homestead are being preserved in the park, and recommended the installation of permanent chess tables at the park.

3. Request to Alter a Heritage Designated Property-Sandford Farm, 796 Stargazer Drive, formerly 784 Eglinton Avenue West, Ward 6

Corporate Report dated July 16, 2010 from the Commissioner of Community Services with respect to a request to alter a heritage designated property, Sandford Farm, located at 796 Stargazer Drive, formerly 784 Eglinton Avenue West, in Ward 6.

Recommendation

That the request to alter the Sandford Farm property, 796 Stargazer Drive, formerly 784 Eglinton Avenue West, as described in the report from the Commissioner of Community Services, dated July 16, 2010, be approved, and that the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

CS.08.STA W6

Approved

Recommendation HAC-0044-2010 (Councillor Parrish)

1. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

Minutes of the meeting held May 25, 2010.

MG.07

Approved (Bernie Hu)

DEPUTATIONS

The following depositions were heard in conjunction with Item 6 on the agenda.

- B. Glen Broll, Glen Schnarr & Associates Inc., and David Eckler, AERA Architects, consultants for the property owner with respect to Item 6.

Mr. Broll requested that Mr. Spaziani remove himself from the deliberations on this item, due to a perceived conflict of interest related to Mr. Spaziani's professional relationship with the applicant, and due to Mr. Spaziani providing sketches on this property.

Mr. Spaziani explained that he provided sketches on this property to show that there could be a balanced outcome of saving the building and achieving the commercial needs of the owner. He declared a conflict of interest and removed himself from the Council Chambers.

Mr. Broll indicated that his client has various applications filed with the City for the lands on 305 Lakeshore Road West, which are listed on the City's Heritage Registry. Mr. Broll stated that there has been a great deal of community consultation regarding the noted property.

In response to Rick Mateljan's requests for further details on the Heritage Impact Statement, Mr. Eckler indicated that the subject property is listed on the City's Heritage Registry due to its status as a terminus for the electric railway, but this is untrue. Mr. Eckler stated that the building was the gatehouse to the former Edward Hill Estate, which was inherited by Edwin Hill, then later purchased by Reverend Dudgeon, as his retirement home.

Mr. Eckler advised that the building does not meet the requirements of the Ontario Heritage Act Regulation 09/06, and that while from a design perspective the building is interesting, it does not have historical value for designation and has lost its context. Mr. Eckler advised that he approached his client with a solution that would preserve some of the heritage features of the property, as well as meet the needs of the client, by taking the north and the south façade of the building and implementing them in the new building.

In response to questions from Mr. Mateljan regarding the construction drawings pre- and

post- the decision to retain the Hill Gatehouse/Dudgeon Cottage, Mr. Broll indicated that the design has changed to reflect the request of the community for a two-story building, which did not accommodate the needs of the Bank of Montreal, who subsequently chose not to lease the building. Mr. Broll indicated that they have had to create very fluid drawings that are easily changeable. Mr. Broll stated that at 305 and 301 Lakeshore Road West, an application has been filed for a CIBC building. The site where CIBC is currently located in Port Credit is being acquired by the City, and as such, CIBC would like to relocate to the subject lands. Mr. Broll advised that while they only require one level, CIBC is willing to move into a two story building. Mr. Broll indicated that Mr. Eckler's design has incorporated the façade of the Hill Gatehouse/Dudgeon Cottage.

Mr. Eckler advised that the design has simplified the building and added some details to enhance the Hill Gatehouse/Dudgeon Cottage façade and to make the distinct features compatible. Mr. Eckler indicated that while there are difficulties, he could see the two buildings being a very good match.

In response to Mr. Mateljan's questions regarding the landmark status of the subject property, Mr. Eckler indicated that the building has lost its context, but that relocating it would enhance its status as a landmark.

Mr. Mateljan and Mr. Eckler discussed the potential challenges for the developer should designation be implemented. Both parties agreed on the need to cooperate in achieving a mutually beneficial resolution.

In response to Jim Tovey's question regarding consideration to Michael Spaziani's plan, Mr. Broll advised that there were a number of iterations of the plan that were considered, and that there are competing interests on the site and a need to use as much of the site as possible. Mr. Broll indicated that the applicant is attempting to balance the needs of the community and the property user.

- C. Representatives from the Town of Port Credit Association, Cranberry Cove Port Credit Ratepayers Association, Port Credit Village Residents' Association with respect to Item 6.

Judy Smith, member of the Cranberry Cove Port Credit Association Executive, spoke about the opportunity for this redevelopment process to create a framework for future Mainstreet development along Lakeshore Road. Ms. Smith advised that Senator Homes promised residents a copy of the Heritage Impact Study, regarding the subject property, when it was completed. Ms. Smith advised that Mayor McCallion held a meeting with representatives from CIBC, Senator Homes, and the local ratepayers on May 17, 2010, at which time representatives from Senator Homes agreed to provide copies of technical reports to the ratepayers. Ms. Smith advised that no reports were provided, and instead they received short notice of the Heritage Advisory Committee meeting, and a Corporate Report not recommending designation. Ms. Smith argued that the Hill Gatehouse/Dudgeon Cottage should remain in its current location, as it is the western gateway to the new Mainstreet commercial area in Port Credit, and that the Heritage

Advisory Committee vote to designate the property.

Richard Collins, a resident in Port Credit, presented his report, which articulates why the subject property is worthy of heritage designation. Mr. Collins argued that based on Regulation 09/06 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the subject property is worthy of designation as the building is rare, unique, and displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit. Mr. Collins argued that the subject property has not lost its context, as it is a community landmark. Mr. Collins argued that the building did act as a transit stop, and it demarcated the western extremity of the Toronto Transit Commission. Mr. Collins provided a detailed historical background on Reverend Dudgeon, the Houston Family and the Hill Family.

Rod Male, Chair of the Planning and Building Committee of the Port Credit Village Ratepayers Association, stated that while Mr. Broll suggested that there was some difficulty in working with the ratepayers groups, the residents are simply asking the applicant to be consistent with the City's Official Plan, and other by-laws in place. Mr. Male indicated that the residents have met with executives from CIBC, and he feels that there is some room for compromise, noting that the CIBC has previously adapted alternative uses and moved into buildings unlike their prototypes. Mr. Male indicated that AREA Architects provided the residents with an in-depth history of the Hill Gatehouse/Dudgeon Cottage, but felt that the conclusion of the report was inconsistent with the body of the report. Mr. Male argued that this building should stand alone in its current location.

Jim Danahy, Vice President, Town of Port Credit Association, indicated that contrary to the developer's assurances, ratepayers groups in Port Credit did not receive copies of technical reports, as promised. Mr. Danahy indicated that the Hill Gatehouse/Dudgeon Cottage rivals other buildings designated in the City of Mississauga, and that the cottage is in danger, as the 60-day time period for the applicant is expiring, the building is in disrepair, and there is no evidence that the owner is taking any measure to protect it. Mr. Danahy indicated that the current location of the Hill Gatehouse/ Dudgeon Cottage will allow valuable on-street, lay-by parking, and that CIBC has locations in heritage buildings and new buildings in heritage areas, and does not believe that CIBC is unwilling to compromise with the community. Mr. Danahy invited the developer to sit down with the community to come to a constructive solution. Mr. Danahy requested that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend designation.

In response, to a question posed by Mr. Tovey, Mr. Broll indicated that there is no drive thru ATM planned for the CIBC. Mr. Broll indicated that he has been working with the ratepayers groups. Mr. Broll advised that he has provided the residents with copies of the applications submitted to the City, but with regard to the technical reports, he would like to have the reports addressed through the City processes, before providing copies to the ratepayer groups. Mr. Broll indicated that he wanted the Heritage Impact Statement to be reviewed by the Heritage Advisory Committee before it was forwarded to the ratepayers.

As requested by Mr. Tovey, Mr. Eckler confirmed that Edwin Hill sold the cottage as a

lot and did not demolish it.

In response to Mr. Tovey's question regarding leaving the cottage in its current location, Mr. Eckler indicated that the removal of the cottage is necessary due to the transportation issues created, restricting access to Lakeshore Road West. Mr. Eckler indicated that he does not believe that the conclusion in the Heritage Impact Statement differs from the body, but rather that the conclusion indicates that while there is some heritage value to the property, it does not meet the criteria in Regulation 09/06. Mr. Eckler indicated that the heritage value of the property would not be lost in this proposal, and that a commemorative plaque would be erected at the new location highlighting what the building meant to the community.

Mr. Broll advised that in 1984 a demolition permit was issued for this property, but was not acted upon. Mr. Broll encouraged the Heritage Advisory Committee to support the staff report and recommendation.

Gay Peppin indicated that the building has caught her attention on many occasions, and while she previously did not know the history, she is glad to know it now, and of the building's significance to the community. It is a unique building in terms of the structure and location, and she would like to see it retained, as such.

Matthew Wilkinson complimented Mr. Eckler for the detailed Heritage Impact Statement and thanked the community groups for their enthusiasm, as it is usually the committee members that have to go out to the community to convince residents of the heritage value of certain properties. Mr. Wilkinson read a quick list of historical main houses in Mississauga that have lost their gatehouses and only two gatehouses that have survived where the main building has been removed. Mr. Wilkinson stated that gatehouses are important and contribute to an understanding of the former corresponding estate house, as well as the development history of a community and the continuing evolution of the surrounding area. Mr. Wilkinson advised that he is familiar with the subject property. Mr. Wilkinson indicated that the community groups and the local Councillor have helped to establish the landmark status of the building.

Bernie Hu indicated that he was concerned with the maintenance of the subject property, and that the developer should be responsible for protecting the building.

Craig Lawrence advised that there is an ongoing feeling that the Heritage Advisory Committee is on the back-end of the process. Mr. Lawrence indicated that the problem lies with the committee becoming involved in the process at the final stage, after hundreds of thousands of dollars have been spent by developers. Mr. Lawrence suggested that the committee become involved at the beginning of the process, providing input on heritage listed buildings. Mr. Lawrence indicated that the committee is now in a situation where the developer is ready to move the process forward, but the ratepayers are opposed, and the local Councillor has come out in support of designation with a strongly worded letter. Given the community's support and the Councillor's support, Mr. Lawrence supported designation.

Jim Holmes stated that this property was a clear example of a building that should be preserved.

Mr. Mateljan indicated that he does not recall the last time the committee has seen such thorough presentations from both the applicant and the community. Mr. Mateljan indicated that Mr. Eckler's report is very good and has enhanced the knowledge of the building, and the community has put together a well-researched, thorough, and engaging report. Mr. Mateljan advised that this is a unique situation, as everyone who has reviewed this building has noted things that are worth preserving. Mr. Mateljan noted that this is a very small building located at the corner of a very large site, and that the ability to determine an adaptive reuse should not be as difficult as in other situations. Mr. Mateljan stated that while he understands the difficulties for the bank, he does not find the arguments offered very compelling, as any institution or developer that wants to come into a community should be accommodating to the needs of that community, and as such the heritage building should not be compromised to accommodate a prototypical building. Mr. Mateljan indicated that the building has merit to be designated.

Mr. Tovey indicated that he agreed with all his colleagues and that it was great to see citizens here in support of their community. Mr. Tovey agreed with Mr. Lawrence regarding some of the difficulties in the heritage processes. Mr. Tovey indicated that there is a system in place to manage heritage designated properties, putting the committee in a front end situation, but there is a need for a better way to address heritage listed properties. Mr. Tovey moved designation of the subject property.

Councillor Carlson indicated that the building should be designated just as all the committee members have indicated, for all the reasons listed in the two reports. Councillor Carlson stressed how important it is that all buildings in Port Credit be rigorously reviewed and considered at the site plan stage. Councillor Carlson indicated that the Hill Gatehouse/Dudgeon Cottage is a great entrance feature and a modest piece of heritage that could be easily preserved. Councillor Carlson agreed with his colleagues on the need to designate.

Councillor Parrish referred to the Forster house, in Ward 6, and the success of its adaptive reuse, as an example of the importance of preserving heritage buildings in the City of Mississauga. Councillor Parrish supported designation of the subject property.

6. Request to Remove Heritage Listed Building Hill Gatehouse/ Dudgeon Cottage-305 Lakeshore Road West, Ward 1

Corporate Report dated July 16, 2010 from the Commissioner of Community Services with respect to a request to remove heritage listed building Hill Gatehouse/Dudgeon Cottage located at 305 Lakeshore Road West, Ward 1.

Recommendation

Notwithstanding the Corporate Report dated July 16, 2010 from the Commissioner of Community Services titled "Request to Remove Heritage Listed Building Hill Gatehouse/

Dudgeon Cottage 305 Lakeshore Road West (Ward 1)", the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Hill Gatehouse/ Dudgeon Cottage, located at 305 Lakeshore Road West be designated under the Ontario Heritage Act for the property's physical/design, historical/associative and contextual value, and that the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

CS.08. LAK W1

Alternate

Recommendation HAC-0045-2010 (J. Tovey)

MATTERS TO BE CONSIDERED

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

2. Proposed addition to the Heritage Register, Russell Langmaid School, 170 Church Street (HAC-0066-2009- October 27, 2009)

Corporate Report dated September 11, 2009 from the Commissioner of Community Services with respect to the proposed heritage designation of Russell Langmaid School located at 170 Church Street, in Ward 11.

Councillor Carlson advised of the need to defer the item to the November 16, 2010 Heritage Advisory Committee meeting due to ongoing real estate transactions.

Gay Peppin requested information on whether there were any changes made to the building. Councillor Carlson advised that no changes have been made to the exterior of the building.

Recommendation

That the matter with respect to the proposed heritage designation of Russell Langmaid School located at 170 Church Street be deferred to the November 16, 2010 Heritage Advisory Committee meeting.

CS.08.CHU W11

ALTERNATE

Recommendation HAC-0046-2010 (G. Peppin)

NEW BUSINESS

4. Request to Demolish a Heritage Listed Property-921 Longfellow Avenue, Ward 2

Corporate Report dated July 16, 2010 from the Commissioner of Community Services with respect to a request to demolish a heritage listed property located at 921 Longfellow

Avenue, in Ward 2.

Recommendation

That the property at 921 Longfellow Avenue, which is listed on the City's Heritage Register, is not worthy of heritage designation, and consequently, that the owner's request to demolish the structure proceed through the applicable process.

CS.08.LON W2

Approved

Recommendation HAC-0047-2010 (C. Lawrence)

5. Request to Demolish a Heritage Listed Property-1185 Vesta Drive, Ward 1

Corporate Report dated July 16, 2010 from the Commissioner of Community Services with respect to a request to demolish a heritage listed property located at 1185 Vesta Drive, Ward 1.

Recommendation

That the property at 1185 Vesta Drive, which is listed on the City's Heritage Register, is not worthy of heritage designation, and consequently, that the owner's request to demolish the structure proceed through the applicable process.

CS.08.VES W1

Approved

Recommendation HAC-0048-2010 (M. Wilkinson)

7. Request to Demolish a Heritage Listed Property-1242 Mona Road, Ward 1

Corporate Report dated June 25, 2010 from the Commissioner of Community Services with respect to a request to demolish a heritage listed property located at 1242 Mona Road, in Ward 1.

Rick Mateljan questioned what qualifications were established for those individuals who write the heritage impact statements.

Councillor Carlson advised that there are no qualifications in place.

Recommendation

That the property at 1242 Mona Road, which is listed on the City's Heritage Register, is not worthy of heritage designation, and consequently, that the owner's request to demolish the structure proceed through the applicable process.

CS.08.MON W1

Approved

Recommendation HAC-0049-2010 (R. Mateljan)

8. Status of Outstanding Issues from Heritage Advisory Committee

Chart as at July 27, 2010 identifying the status of the outstanding issues from the Heritage Advisory Committee.

Matthew Wilkinson requested that the issue of artifact storage at the Pinchin Property be added to the noted chart.

Gay Peppin advised of the need to have a tracking system of City owned heritage buildings listing the maintenance needs of each building, so as not to lose sight of the City's heritage assets.

Councillor Carlson advised that at the previous Heritage Advisory Committee meeting, Ken Owen, Manager, Facilities & Property Management, indicated that he would provide that information to the committee.

Recommendation:

That the chart identifying the status of the outstanding issues from the Heritage Advisory Committee as at July 27, 2010, be received.

MG.07

Received

Recommendation HAC-0050-2010 (M. Wilkinson)

Recommendation:

That Ken Owen, Director, Facilities and Property Management be requested to provide the Heritage Advisory Committee with a quarterly report of the maintenance schedule for City-owned Heritage buildings.

MG.07

Approved

Recommendation HAC-0051-2010 (G. Peppin)

9. Status of Subcommittees/Ad Hoc Committees – Report from Chairs

9.1 Heritage Designation Subcommittee

No update to report at this time. Matthew Wilkinson noted the importance of having more members on the subcommittee.

9.3 Heritage Tree Subcommittee

Gay Peppin provided an update on her meeting with City Staff and the Commissioner of Community Services. Ms. Peppin expressed her frustration regarding the slow progression on the issue of Heritage Trees.

Councillor Carlson advised Ms. Peppin to send him an email outlining some of the issues discussed, and that he would forward it to Dave Marcucci, Manager, Park Planning.

9.2 Public Awareness Subcommittee

Update on the Purchase of a Display Board for the Heritage Advisory Committee.

Discussion ensued regarding the purchase of a display board for the committee.

The Legislative Coordinator was requested to set a meeting date with the display vendor. Matthew Wilkinson advised that he and Ms. Peppin would have all the information required for the September Heritage Advisory Committee meeting.

INFORMATION ITEMS

10. Heritage Interpretation Program- Sandford Farm Neighbourhood Park, 845 White Clover Way, Region of Peel, City of Mississauga, Ontario

Heritage Interpretation Program dated June 2010 from Golder Associates with respect to Sandford Farm Neighbourhood Park, 845 White Clover Way.

CS.08.WHI W6

Received

Recommendation HAC-0052-2010 (M. Wilkinson)

11. Nominations for the Ontario Medal for Good Citizenship

Letter dated May, 2010 from The Honourable Dr. Eric Hoskins, Minister of Citizenship and Immigration with respect to nominating deserving citizens for the Ontario Medal for Good Citizenship.

PR.11

Received

Recommendation HAC-0053-2010 (M. Wilkinson)

12. Letter of Resignation from Elaine Eigl, Citizen Member, Heritage Advisory Committee

Letter of Resignation effective June 28, 2010 from Elaine Eigl, Citizen Member, Heritage Advisory Committee advising of her resignation from the committee due to her employment with the City of Mississauga.

MG.07

Received

Recommendation HAC-0054-2010 (M. Wilkinson)

13. QEW Credit River Bridge Class Environmental Assessment Study Notice of Community Workshops WS1

Letter dated June 30, 2010 from Catherine Christiani, Community Workshop Coordinator, Ecoplans Ltd., inviting a representative from the Heritage Advisory Committee to participate in a Community Workshop taking place July 17, 2010 regarding the QEW Credit River Bridge Class Environmental Assessment Study.

EC.14

Received

Recommendation HAC-0055-2010 (M. Wilkinson)

14. Notice of Study Commencement Highway 403 and Queen Elizabeth Way Improvements

Notice of study commencement for the Highway 403 and Queen Elizabeth Way improvements from Trafalgar Road to Winston Churchill Boulevard.

Recommend Receipt

EC.14

Received

Recommendation HAC-0056-2010 (M. Wilkinson)

DATE OF NEXT MEETING – September 28, 2010 at 9:00 a.m.

OTHER BUSINESS

Matthew Wilkinson advised that Doors Open Mississauga would be taking place on September 18, 2010.

Mr. Wilkinson invited committee members to attend the plaque unveiling at the Forster House. Mr. Wilkinson advised that he visited the Masonic Lodge of Mississauga, and that there was an opportunity for the Heritage Advisory Committee to hold a meeting on the grounds in the new year.

Gay Peppin advised the committee of a lecture at the Mississauga Central Library that would be held by the Heritage Board on the Cooksville Brickyard.

ADJOURNMENT – 12:02 p.m.